

A Multi-Stakeholder Pathway
Towards Food Security and
Sustainable Food Systems
in Pakistan

MARCH 30, 2021











AwazCDS Pakistan: Established in 1995 and is registered as not for profit organization with registrar joint stock companies under Societies Registration Act 1860 and enjoys special consultative status with United Nation's Economic & Social Council (UN ECOSOC). AwazCDS Pakistan's core mission is to develop integrated and innovative solutions in cooperation with partners at all levels to secure the future of marginalised communities especially by creating rightful spaces and choices of life. For more information please visit www.awazcds.org.pk

Pakistan Development Alliance: Established in 2014, is an alliance of 107 national level NGOs/Networks working together through developmental and rights based approaches to address issues in governance and accountability across the country especially in the implementation of SDGs. The alliance is led by AwazCDS-Pakistan and is governed by elected national, provincial and regional executive committees at national, provincial and regional level. PDA is part of various national, regional and global alliances and forums including Asia Development Alliance (ADA), Asia CSOs Partnership for Sustainable Development (APSD), Action for Sustainable Development (A4SD), Global Call to Action against Poverty (GCAP), CIVICUS/AGNA- Affinity Group of National Associations and Transparency Accountability and Partnerships-TAP Network etc. For more information please visit: www.pda.net.pk

Contact at National Secretariat of AwazCDS Pakistan/ Pakistan Development Alliance

Flat # 3 & 4, First Floor, Akbari Plaza, MPCHS, E11/1, Islamabad

Phone # +92-51-2305233 & +92-51-2305210

Email: info@awazcds.org.pk

About VSO: Voluntary Service Overseas (VSO) International is the world's leading independent international development organization that utilizes volunteers to deliver high impact development projects. VSO currently has 821 staff working in 23 countries across Africa, Asia and the Pacific and an operating budget of 76 million. Since our foundation in 1958, VSO Volunteers of 94 nationalities have worked in over 90 countries. We recruit highly skilled and specialized international volunteer experts through our nine global recruitment hubs.

VSO has been working in Pakistan since 1987; during these three decades VSO has engaged the skills and expertise of 300 international volunteers and 1222 National and community volunteers to support livelihood, education, participation, governance and youth initiatives. The volunteers engaged are sector specialist and VSO was able to place them with a diverse range of over 70 partner organizations across Pakistan. VSO works across 06 districts in Islamabad Capital Territory, Punjab and Sindh provinces of Pakistan.

VSO Contact Details

Sara Tower, MPCHS, E11/-3 Islamabad

Tel (+92-51-2223903-4, email info.pakistan@vsoint.org

Conceived, written and edited by: Zia ur Rehman
Conducted by: AwazCDS-Pakistan

Facilitated by: Pakistan Development Alliance

Published by:

Supported by:

Designed by:

Publishing Date:

AwazCDS-Pakistan

VSO Pakistan & UK Aid

Ishfaq Khan Khalil

March 2021

Quantity: 500

ISBN No: 978-969-7844-06-7

Copyrights:

Awaz Foundation Pakistan: Centre for Development Services

All rights reserved however the content of this report may be reproduced with the due acknowledgement to AwazCDS-Pakistan and author

Table of Contents

Acronyms	i
Forward	ii
Acknowledgments	iv
Messages and Reviews	v
Introduction	1
Findings of the Consultations	2
Understanding of the Food System and Key Impediments Towards Food Security	2
Pricing & Governance	2
Lack of Infrastructure	2
Lack of Access to Financial Capital	3
Environmental Externalities and Growing Health Risks	3
Lack of Investment in Research and Extension Services	3
Gender Inequalities	3
Socio-Economic and Natural Factors	3
Sustainable Supply and Affordability of Agricultural Inputs	3
Key Policy Recommendations	5
Strengthening Farmers' Knowledge and Networks for Sustainable Food Supply and Distribution:	5
Promoting Partnerships and Use of Technology to Address Food Losses	5
Linking Financial Capital with Sustainable Land Use Practices	5
Connecting Urban Centers with their Surrounding Agricultural Community and Promoting the Concept of Farmers' Markets	5
Reducing Public Sector Monopoly on Research, Development & Extension Services	5
Promoting Nutritious Diets and Food Security as a Basic Human Right:	6
Public awareness campaigns to Promote Sustainable & Healthy Consumption Patterns and to Curb Food Losses:	6
Conclusion	7
Annexure - 1 : Citizen Charter Of Demand For Food Security & Sustainable Livelihoods In Pakistan	8
Annexure - 2 : Press Coverage	10
Annexure - 3 : Consultation Tool	11

Acronyms

ADA	Asia Development Alliance
AGNA	Affinity Group of National Associations
APSD	Asia CSOs Partnership f or Sustainable Development
A4SD	Action for Sustainable Development
СВА	Collective Bargaining Agents
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CPEC	China–Pakistan Economic Corridor
CRC	Convention on the Rights of Child
CSO	Civil Society Organisations
Fls	Financial Institutions
GCAP	Global Call to Action against Poverty
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
ICESCR	International Covena nt on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
NARI	National Advocacy for Rights of Innocent (NARI) Foundation
NGOs	Non Governmental Organizations
PDA	Pakistan Development Alliance
PARC	Pakistan Agriculture Research Centre
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SUNCSN	Scaling up Nutrition Civil Society Network
TAP	Transparency Accountability and Partnerships
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UN ECOSOC	United Nation's Economic & Social Council
VSO	Voluntary Services Overseas

Foreword

Pakistan is one of the largest food producing countries in the world yet we have severe challenges around availability of even staple food items, accessibility & necessary quantity of food for all and above than all quality food produce and its by-products. Nutritional aspects, utilisation behaviours and sustainable provision of adequate food for all are also un addressed yet. More than 64% population lives in rural areas of Pakistan and around 90% of them are directly engaged with agriculture sector, 43% work in agricultural fields as informal labourer to make their livings. Agriculture, livestock and fisheries are largely known as food assurance sectors in every country and so as in Pakistan however these sectors are highly un-regulated and under-developed due to lack of research and poor extension services for farmers, livestock entrepreneurs and fisherfolks.

Food production, processing and consumption patterns require immediate attentions if we wish to meet the needs of 220 million people growing further @ 2.029% per annum. Today 40 million people are under nourished whereas more than 40% children of age less than 14 are stunted and 28% are wasted. If the population grows with the same pace Pakistan we will have more than 100 million people facing severe food insecurity challenges. Although Pakistan's current agriculture growth rate (2.7%) is encouraging against the average growth rate (1.8%) of last five years however the overall contribution of agriculture sector in national GDP has been severely declined to 18% from the average of around 23% for the last five years.

Pakistan is also a signatory of many international treaties and conventions including UDHR, ICESCR, CRC, CEDAW, SDGs and Voluntary Guidelines to support the progressive realization of right to adequate food for all citizens. These commitments demand that Pakistan should recognize food and nutrition security as fundamental human right however this is pertinent to mention here that Pakistan's Constitution has yet to recognize right to food for all.

In order to comply with some commitments, Ministry of National Food Security & Research announced Pakistan's first ever national food security policy in March 2018. The policy was made and announced in haste as the five years term on previous government was ending in June 2018. The new government has not bothered yet to focus on this issue in spite of passage of three years of its term. This is interesting to learn that policy has acknowledged food security as the first and foremost element of national security of Pakistan. The policy also aims to ensure modern and efficient food production and distribution system that can best contribute towards food security and nutrition in terms of availability, access, utilization and stability. The policy also aimed to contribute in poverty alleviation, eradication of hunger and malnutrition, provision of sustainable food production systems to make agriculture sector more productive, competitive, climate resilient and profitable. Change of government means change of policies in Pakistan, we hardly see few examples of continuity in policies by subsequent governments and most of them are related to defense related matters which are actually by no way in control of civilians in fact. Mentioning food security as foremost element of national security would not bring any fruit to nation if the issue is not given its due attention. After 18th constitutional amendment in 2010, provinces are expected to have their own independent food security policies as agriculture, livestock and fisheries are devolved and food security and nutrition are actually linked with them.

During the consultations with concerned stakeholders and farmer community for the preparation of this citizens' position paper on food security lack of coordination among federal and provincial authorities

surfaced as one of the major challenge in implementation of national food security policy in letter and spirit. Many related officials especially from smaller provinces also shared their concerns, fears and apprehensions regarding the implementation process of the policy as well as inclusion of some strategies like establishment of CPEC agriculture development zones and land & water resource management etc. Therefore, some of the issues related to food security are immensely critical and politically sensitive that require immediate attentions of our political, social and developmental fraternities in order to ensure, the achievement of basic determinants of food security, striking the balance between agriculture and livestock, use of technologies and constant flow of financial investments on related research and development.

This Citizens' Position Paper especially sheds light on many of the aforementioned issues and shares the voices of common farmers, livestock entrepreneurs, fisherfolks as well as consumers for the attentions of our related federal and provincial authorities to ponder upon. I hope the findings and recommendations of this position paper will contribute in reducing hunger and achieving food security in Pakistan.

We will welcome your feedback and suggestions for improvement at zia@awazcds.org.pk With profound regards

With profound regards

Zia ur Rehman
Founder & Chief Executive
AwazCDS-Pakistan



Acknowledgments

We really acknowledge and appreciate the contributions, inputs, discussions, criticism and suggestions from all the key contributors and partners of Pakistan Development Alliance especially representatives of farmers, women agriculture workers, livestock entrepreneurs, fisherfolks and representatives of various government departments.

We also acknowledge Dr. Hamid Jalil, Member Food Security & Climate, Planning Commission of Pakistan at Ministry of Planning Development & Special Initiatives, Dr. Muhammad Azeem, Chairman Pakistan Agriculture Research Centre (PARC), Mr. Hashim Bilal, Country Director VSO Pakistan, Dr. Irshad Danish, Regional Coordinator SUNCSN Asia for their thoughtful reviews and feedback on this position paper.

The members of **National Executive Council of Pakistan Development Alliance** also deserve our sincere appreciations for their guidance and support in development of questionnaire to collect citizens' voices from all walks of life.

Our all-out appreciations are for executives and volunteers of provincial and district partner organizations and related departments especially NARI Development Organization who have, organized awareness sessions with community members & key influential of their respective District and, also gathered information from different stakeholders including farmer and fisheries community.

The whole assignment of conducting capacity building of District Partner Organizations and their staff /volunteers might not have been so successfully planed and conducted without the role of Ms. Huma Aziz- Manager MEAL AwazCDS-Pakistan & Focal Point PDA as well as Ms. Marium Amjad Khan-Campaign Manager- AwazCDS-Pakistan for their coordination, dedication and support in timely completion of this task. We must not forget to appreciate Mr. Ishfaq Khan Khalil Communication & Information Technology Officer at the National Secretariat of AwazCDS-Pakistan for composing and designing this report.

Finally, all our appreciations are for VSO Pakistan and UK Aid as without their generous financial support the whole intervention would not have been possible Thanks and regards

Zia ur Rehman
Chief Executive - AwazCDS-Pakistan, Islamabad
National Chair – Pakistan Development Alliance

M. Ali Kemal Chief SDGs, Ministry of Planning, Development and Special Initiatives



A Multi-Stakeholder Pathway Towards Food Security and Sustainable Food Systems in Pakistan

Partnerships as described in Goal 17 of Sustainable Development Goals is one the vital component to achieve SDGs. Partnership with one key stakeholder is not enough, it requires multi-stakeholder engagement to achieve SDGs effectively and sustainable.

Goal 2 (end hunger) indeed is a very important goal in achieving SDGs overall. In general mostly Goal 2 is misconceived with ability to pay for food and availability of food. However, it just not deals with food security but also with nutrition and then several determinants of food security including Government's footprint, labour productivity in agriculture sector, sustainable land use practices, and food price anomalies.

Several targets from other goals are significantly linked with Goal 2 and improvements in those targets are pertinent in achieving goal 2 that includes poverty, gender inequality, water availability, energy requirement, education and awareness, better health, innovation, climate mitigation and adaptation, better institution etc.

The report highlights issues related to food security, its importance to achieve 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, policy and implementation inefficiencies and propose recommendations for better assessment, design, implementation, and monitoring of Sustainable Food System. The analysis is based on multi-stakeholder consultations with the farmers, livestock entrepreneurs, fisher folks, consumers, University students, Government agriculture officials.

The report is a good addition as far as multi-stakeholder consultations are concerned. Nonetheless the results and recommendations are reiterating the old known facts. For instance, the key impediments food security includes Pricing & Governance, Lack of Infrastructure, Lack of access to Financial Resources, Environmental Externalities and growing Health Risks, Lack of Investment in Research, Gender Inequality, Socioeconomic & Natural Factors, Sustainable Supply and Affordability of Agriculture Inputs, Depleting Water Resources and Traditional Farming Practices.

Though the result shows that we were having these problems and we are still having these problems that need to be fixed. Although it is a multi-stakeholder consultation but overwhelmingly the key recommendations include tasks for government only. Role of other stakeholders are mostly missing in it.

I would urge authors to use Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS) data instead of using other data sources. PBS data is reliable, sampled and fulfil the statistical characteristics. For instance, PSLM 2019-20 is reporting 16.4 percent households in the country are experiencing moderate or severe food insecurity.

The methodology of computing food insecurity is accepted worldwide and included after the approval of all relevant stakeholders. Reporting data other than the standard accepted methodology would miss out many stakeholders.

In the end, I would propose authors to include response of all the stakeholders (in a summarise form) separately for each segment and then triangulate and look at the problems.

It is good to see that research culture is growing and hopefully through partnerships we will be able to improve it further and use it as evidence based policy making.

Dr. Nazeer Ahmed Chief Nutrition & SUN Focal Point, Ministry of Planning Development & Special Initiatives, Government of Pakistan



Secure and nutritional food is a key for healthy, active and full of potentials society. Unfortunately, Pakistan is one of the countries where we observe both food security and nutrition as a challenge for the last many years because majority of people do not have physical, social and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food that meets their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life. The current government has initiated very effective initiative to reach out to poorest of the poor to meet their food requirements under *Koi Bhooka Na Soye* (no one sleeps hungry) program. This program will also help achieve some targets of SDG2 (end hunger), however food availability to all, economic & physical access to food, its utilization and stability would remain a challenge unless we are able to reduce the high rate of population growth as well as increase the rate of agriculture productions.

The citizens' position paper on food security & sustainable livelihoods has rightly highlighted the issues as well as recommended solutions towards the achievement of SDGs particularly SDG2. The government is aiming to ensure modern and efficient food production & distribution system that can be best contribute towards the food security and nutrition in terms of availability, access, utilization and stability. Our food security policy focuses on farmers access to quality inputs like seeds, fertilizers and modern machinery etc. The current government's major priority is alleviation of poverty, eradication of hunger and malnutrition by promoting sustainable food production systems and by making agri culture more climate resilient, productive, competitive and profitable.

The federal government particularly Planning Commission of Pakistan is striving to ensure harmony in federal and provincial policies towards food security and sustainable livelihoods. We also encourage engagement with CSOs and other related stakeholders to join hands together to better address aforementioned challenges as well as to achieve fruitful results in order to make our nation healthy and strong.

I appreciate the efforts of AwazCDS and Pakistan Development Alliance for presenting this citizens' position paper in connection with UN Food System Summit 2021 and assure all my support to take forward the recommendations at every level.

Hashim Bilal Country Director VSO-Pakistan



VSO's Social accountability and social inclusion is a process of change that empowers poor and marginalized people to lead their own development by exercising voice, claiming their rights and holding those in power to account.

Social accountability and social inclusion are integral part Education and livelihood Support Program of VSO-Pakistan as it provides an opportunity to the most deprived segments of the society for sharing the practical challenges which create hurdle in their upgradation and improvement of their economic status. This program is a blend of social accountability and risk management for measuring the implications of food security, its challenges and how these are affecting our poor communities.

One of the major outcomes of this program is the Citizens' Position Paper on Food Security and Sustainable Livelihood which represents the voices of the marginalized communities which are collected through the rigorous consultative process carried out in the field by engaging fisher folk, farmers, young people, relevant government departments i.e., Livestock, fisheries, agriculture departments, CSOs, Media, minorities and PWDs. The findings of the position paper are published for increasing advocacy efforts on the identified issues and to hold key stakeholders accountable including parliamentarians' members of related SDGs Task Forces and government authorities. The citizens also recommended the immediate as well as necessary measures for adaptation of climate smart modern techniques and technology for improving the food production, processing, and consumption patterns in Pakistan as it will contribute to reduce food wastage and increase the production of the crops.

The Position Paper reflects recommendation which will not only help VSO's future programming on Food security, but it will also support the government of Pakistan and guide other relevant stakeholders for designing programmes that will help in improving the food security and livelihood status of our communities and achieving the global commitments including Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Pakistan.

VSO appreciates and recognize the efforts of AwazCDS-Pakistan, and member organizations of Pakistan Development Alliance as without their consistent support, commitment and hard work the process of position paper on Food Security and Sustainable Livelihood could not have been accomplished.

Dr Shafqat Munir Ahmad Research Fellow, Resilient Development Program Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Pakistan



The citizens' position paper on 'A Multi-Stakeholder Pathway Towards Food Security and Sustainable Food Systems in Pakistan', an apropos to the UN Food Summit in September 2021, represents cross sections of civil society's position they expressed in a citizens' consultation on the subject, puts forward comprehensive food security and food systems analyses, and comes up with strong key findings and policy propositions for multiple stakeholders.

If we see the findings of the paper, we see that food security is being perpetuated because of food distribution and supply chain related systems that cause imbalance in demand and supply and hence cause price inflation of food. Food no more seems to be a luxury of those who can afford it; this is a responsibility of the state under article 38 of the Constitution. Besides ensuring other basis needs, the constitutional clause provides basic necessities of life, such as food, clothing, housing, education and medical relief, for all such citizens, irrespective of sex, caste, creed or race, as are permanently or temporarily unable to earn their livelihood on account of infirmity, sickness or unemployment. Now this article calls for ensuring food security for all. The citizen's position paper provides the premise on the basis of fundamental rights to food and livelihood with the SDGs mantra of 'No one is left behind'.

The position paper aliens its recommendations with the SDGs commitments and achievements calling upon the government to address the risks of COVID19 on public health and overall development. The COVID19 has hampered livelihood options for the people and reduced viability of millions. The position paper advocates for prioritizing agriculture sector that could reverse the negative impacts on the food supply mechanism so that food reaches to everyone in terms of access and affordability of food.

On top of sustainable food production, the position paper recommends to revamp the food supply and distribution system in consultation with farmers and it calls for strengthening farmers' traditional knowledge system and equipping the farmers with modern agriculture techniques and technologies so that they can benefit from both the traditional knowledge and new technologies to reduce food losses. The punch line the position paper draws is that food systems should not be monopolized by the public sector rather farmers' led alliances and networks should be consulted in policy making on food security issues. To conclude, the paper focuses on promoting nutritious diets and food security as basic human rights as enshrines in the Constitution of Pakistan. Food is a human need and a basic right and it should not be seen only as market led process with hardcore economy approach rather be dealt with a political economy and human rights lens.

I think the citizens' position paper 'A Multi-Stakeholder Pathway Towards Food Security and Sustainable Food Systems in Pakistan' will prove to be a baseline for discussion around the World Food Summit' and provide policy recommendation to the government of Pakistan.

Aftab Alam Khan International Consultant on Food Security, Livelihoods and Climate Change



Stakeholders are essential parts of the food and agriculture system. Their participation is essential for the development and resilience of this sector. Nevertheless, voices of women and men smallholder farmers, community based organizations and even local government staff rarely included in the decision making processes. Hence, this compendium of multi-stakeholder voices is a welcome step in Pakistan. The Citizen Position Paper brings to fore crucial challenges related to production, marketing and sustainability of food production in Pakistan. Siphoning of subsidies away from smallholder farmers, rising input prices, insufficient and deteriorating farm to market roads are other key constraints noted in the paper. Rising environmental challenges including agrochemicals contaminated surface and subsurface water and insufficient research and extension facilities are other major issues. Inadequate financial services and quality of seeds have also been noted during consultations. The entitlement of good quality food and subsequent nutrition issues further complicate the situation. Gender inequality has deepened all the above constraints.

This position paper is also relevant in the national and global context. COVID19 has exposed the vulnerability of food, agriculture and associated lives, their nutrition and livelihoods. Whereas, climate crisis has overturned many of the human centered achievements by pushing Pakistan to the 5th rank as the most afflicted country in the world. These dual crises demand greater resilience in the system. Resilience requires diversity in food and agriculture system along with adequate capacity of communities to face the challenges. Therefore, the paper guides us for in-depth research in all provinces of Pakistan as well as advocacy initiatives to change policies and their implementations. The Food System Summits also direct us towards the Decade of Action to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by 2030. Therefore, instead of concluding this work, there is a need to continue collaborative efforts of Awaz CDS, Pakistan Development Forum, UKAid, VSO and other organizations and intuitions to harness complementary energies for high performance dividend towards sustainable and resilient food security in Pakistan.

1 Introduction

The sustainability of human food systems is the key to achieve 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Without improving the nutrition of the world's population and eliminating hunger, the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development will just remain a rhetoric. Achieving these objectives, in countries like Pakistan is intrinsically connected to several factors, especially technological advancement and reducing environmental impacts from the production and consumption of food. Designing and implementing sustainable food systems policies and programmes in a systemic way can significantly help achieve the SDGs.

In September 2021, UN Secretary-General António Guterres will convene a Food Systems Summit to raise global awareness and land global commitments and actions that transform food systems to resolve not only hunger, but to reduce diet-related disease and heal the planet. In line with the Secretary General's call for collective action of all citizens to radically change the way we produce, process, and consume food and given that agriculture and allied sectors remain the largest employers in Pakistan, AwazCDS-Pakistan in partnership with Voluntary Services Overseas (VSO) Pakistan collected voices from the primary actors to generate basic evidence and critical foundation for a political agenda and cross-cutting dialogue on possible food system strategies and to influence the process and outcome of the summit and the national food security policies in Pakistan. AwazCDS-Pakistan and its member organizations at the platform of Pakistan Development Alliance, designed a multi-stakeholder tool and gathered primary data from the agriculture-based key stakeholders including 56 representatives from fisher folk community (27 male & 29 female), 54 University students from the agriculture and livestock departments (28 young boys and 26 girls), 62 farmers (36 male & 26 female), 49 Govt agriculture officials and representatives from CSOs and media (36 male and 13 female).

The consultations helped bolster community dialogue on sustainable food systems and provided an opportunity to identify local thought process on key local and global challenges, including climate change, ecological crisis, livelihood crisis etc. This position paper synthesised the findings of the consultations and provides an approach for collaborative policymaking and governance improvement for sustainable food systems. The paper highlights broad range of issues / challenges, our farming community has identified. It also recommends actions for better assessment, design, implementation, and monitoring of Sustainable Food System, leading to better decisions and outcomes regarding livelihoods, health, nutrition, and the environment. The paper also stimulates further discussions between stakeholders and provides foundation for a political agenda and cross-cutting dialogue within the relevant government departments.

2 Findings of the Consultations

Pakistan's traditional, subsistence agriculture sector is the main source of income for about 42.3 percent of the rural population1 and is key to poverty reduction and national food security. The challenges involved with building truly sustainable food systems are multidimensional and interrelated, and thus require a holistic approach. National and global changes—COVID 19 pandemic, food price hike— and national political uncertainty, combined with episodic deterioration in law-and-order situation posed serious threats to Pakistan's economy and food security. Slowed growth, stagnant production figures of key crops, mainly wheat, rice, cotton, maize, potato and fisheries and an unprecedented level of informal trade to neighboring countries have further made the food supply insecure. As a consequence, malnutrition has significantly increased in the country, especially among children and women², resulting in low productivity and low national development³.

The consultations held with the key agriculture stakeholders identified range of issues among different agricultural sub-sectors in Pakistan. These issues are not only applicable for food and fiber crops and fisheries, but also other interrelated areas including horticulture and orchards, livestock, dairy, and forestry etc.

2.1 Understanding of the Food System and Key Impediments Towards Food Security:

The participants mainly shared their views on key food crops including wheat, rice, maize, cotton, sugarcane, and pulses as well as livestock and fisheries. There is a general understanding among the farming community that the availability of wheat is a key indicator to essential food security. At the same time, they also recognise the correlation between scientific growth methods, the benefits of the crop diversification and high crop yield. Most of the participants generally identified confusing state policies, lack of access to resources (financial resources and extension services etc.), growing dependency on inputs, such as pesticides, fertilizers, depleting water resources and traditional farming practices as key impediments to agricultural sustainability and per acre yield. These issues were reported interchangeably, while the participants talked about different phases of the food system, including production, processing, and consumption. The key issues are briefly summarized below:

- 2.1.1 Pricing & Governance: The participants shared their concerns over state commodity pricing mechanisms for various crops, particularly wheat and sugarcane. The general perception is that the benefits of subsidy and support prices are being misdirected and do not reach the poorer small farmers. The participants also stressed the need to re-evaluate farmers access to inputs, which they considered as 'severe constraint to productivity'. The price hike for fertilizers and pesticides, lack of canal irrigation, growing dependency on tube wells for irrigation, dispute over properties, poor maintenance of land record and the cumbersome handling of tenancy issues were identified as some of the key governance issues.
- 2.1.2 Lack of Infrastructure: It was noted that farming community face extreme challenges due to lack of adequate infrastructure, including link roads, cold storage facilities, consistent power supply and cold supply chains for perishable products. The present agricultural markets are inadequate and the distance from farm to market is one of the key causes of exploitation of the small farmers through the middlemen. The participants from fisher folks particularly identified the issue of post-harvest losses in the fisheries industry. Lack of proper market

³2019, UNICEF

1

¹ http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey/chapters_18/02-Agriculture.pdf

^{22017,} Census, Government of Pakistan

- facilities, lack of implementation of the recent regulations, such as use of purse seine and trawl nets etc. in different areas are considered as key challenges.
- 2.1.3 Lack of Access to Financial Capital: The participants showed their concerns over lack of access to financial opportunities. They consider Zarai Taraqiati Bank Limited, commercial banks and cooperative banks as the main supplier of finance; however, the credit facilities are not adequately accessible and small farmers mostly depend on the loans given by friends, relatives, and money lenders. The inadequate supply of loans ultimately affects the timely purchase of inputs and the overall production. It also deprives them from accessing healthy seeds and other quality inputs and ultimately pushes them towards traditional farming practices.
- 2.1.4 Environmental Externalities and Growing Health Risks: The participants also showed their concern over growing contamination of underground fresh water due to excessive use of fertilizers, contamination of harvested food commodities due to toxic chemical residues and disposal of industrial toxic waste into canal water. These factors have long term consequences on the health of the farming community, especially those associated with fisheries and the end users, contributing to increased health and nutrition related issues. The participants also highlighted lack of access to safety equipment and growing health concerns due to exposure to pesticides and other chemicals.
- 2.1.5 Lack of Investment in Research and Extension Services: The participants from government departments, media and CSOs highlighted the need to increase allocation to research and extension services, which is currently significantly lower than the requirement. Moreover, it was highlighted that the research system is not demand based, which limits the utility of research to the emerging needs of the sector. There is a need to undertake basic institutional reforms to increase investment in these critical areas and make research and extension departments accountable. To raise farm productivity, the extension service programs need to be extended. The education of farmers for the adoption of agriculture technology is a massive work and must be carried out systemically and efficiently. It was noted that the lack of funds is the key hurdle in the proper implementation of programs and ultimately result in slow growth of the agricultural production.
- 2.1.6 Gender Inequalities: Most of the participants appreciated the contribution of women and feminization of agriculture sector in the country, while mostly men work in urban areas or abroad. However, generally women's role is not recognized properly. Both male and female participants highlighted how the local traditions deprive women of the right to inherit property, and even if they can inherit, they are not allowed to manage the property and access its income. Also, there are no regulations to protect wage rates for women and mostly women are paid less than men in the labor market. Agriculture labour market is not recognized as formal labour therefore most of the women informal laborers in agriculture sector do not have access to social security and protection services. Also, agricultural labor is not eligible as collective bargaining agents (CBA)
- 2.1.7 Socio-Economic and Natural Factors: Low literacy levels and adherence to traditional practices among farming community stand in the way of adoption of modern technology. Natural factors were also noted as playing an important role in the growth of agriculture and fisheries. If the rain is timely, evenly distributed and there is no hailstorm and attack of pests, the production is plentiful.
- **2.1.8** Sustainable Supply and Affordability of Agricultural Inputs: The participants shared that as a traditional practice, they generally retain cereal seeds from previous crops or purchase it

from fellow farmers, wholesalers, or commission agents. The wholesalers also provide seed from the previous crop stocked by them. In some cases, the wholesalers stock seeds as dealers on behalf of seed companies—national and multinational seed companies as well as the public sector provincial seed corporation, however, such seed varieties are too expensive. The government sector stakeholders confirmed that the provincial seed corporations have a monopoly on the multiplication of improved cultivars released by the public sector research establishments, their processing, and sale to farmers. Private sector seed companies do not have access to the basic seed developed at public sector research outfits. On the other hand, the private sector companies produce and market fertilizers, while the government imports fertilizer when supplies fall short. In both cases, general lack of coordination between public and private entities coupled with lack of regulatory measures impact quality and price of key inputs.

2.2 Key Policy Recommendations

- 2.2.1 Strengthening Farmers' Knowledge and Networks for Sustainable Food Supply and Distribution: The participants emphasized the need to simplify the food value chains, so that less resourced and less educated farming community could also think of value additions and take maximum benefit of the supply and distribution chains. The production, handling, storage, transport, processing, packaging, wholesale, and retail are some of the key functions in the food supply system which should be brought under one wholesome, highly connected food supply system and the local farmers should be educated on the whole chain so that they have appropriate information to establish and strengthen sustainable networks and contribute to the long-term resilience of the food system in their localities.
- 2.2.2 Promoting Partnerships and Use of Technology to Address Food Losses: The journey of Pakistan's subsistence agriculture towards commercialization is slow and with many impediments. The participants identified opportunities, such as strengthening public-private partnership specially to ensure steady supply of agricultural inputs (seeds, fertilizers etc.), improved coordination among food supply chain actors and use of technology to reduce food losses and improved investment in cold storage and transport infrastructure by private companies. Also, it was noted that there is a huge potential to raise awareness among local farmers to adopt resource-efficient practices, such as drip irrigation and reliance on solar energy options to minimize food losses.
- 2.2.3 Linking Financial Capital with Sustainable Land Use Practices: The discussion with CSOs and Agriculture departments suggested that financial institutions (FIs) should take lead in ensuring improved collaboration and standards in the sustainable land use practices. It was suggested that the financial institutions should on one hand simplify and enhance their lending capacity for less literate farming communities, while on the other hand create minimum quality standards and sustainability criteria for sustainable agriculture and land management practices. This new collaborative angle of tackling financial needs with enhanced best practices can open the doors to different approaches to agricultural production. The participants also emphasized the need to reduce financial burden on small farmers through public sector investment and help dealing with issues of credit risk through introducing crop insurance and other potential best practices. The participants also highlighted the need to provide financial support to farming community during harvesting seasons for better yield processing and value additions etc.
- 2.2.4 Connecting Urban Centers with their Surrounding Agricultural Community and Promoting the Concept of Farmers' Markets: The young agriculturists highlighted the need to establish and strengthen connections between urban population and their local farming communities. Policies and public investment can be a game changer to promote farmers' markets to sustain local food chains. It was also noted that strong food system planning and management is required to foster the development of resilient and sustainable, locally owned and run food systems. The participants stressed that such initiatives would promote local employment, especially for poor women and other disadvantaged groups.
- 2.2.5 Reducing Public Sector Monopoly on Research, Development & Extension Services: The participants pointed out that although few national and international private sector companies have their own research and development wings, however, regulations are required to help such companies access the new locally produced seed varieties and the

monopoly of public research departments on such inputs should be minimized to improve availability and access. Also, there is a need to introduce a system where public and private entities could join hands for research and development and awareness raising among farmers on sustainable food production practices.

- 2.2.6 Promoting Nutritious Diets and Food Security as a Basic Human Right: There was a general understanding among participants that government should further enhance their role in society's behavior change and promote healthy and sustainable eating practices. The food practices should be defined through a well-articulated nutrition and food security policy and guideline and the private food processing companies should comply certain quality and dietary standards, while packaging different food items. The access to quality food and nutrition should be considered as a basic human right and appropriate legislative and administrative measures should be taken as part of the broader food system.
- 2.2.7 Public awareness campaigns to Promote Sustainable & Healthy Consumption Patterns and to Curb Food Losses: The need for public awareness raising campaigns was one of the key points in all consultations. There is common understanding that such campaigns through social, print, or electronic media can play a significant role in addressing and curbing unsustainable and unhealthy food consumption patterns. While at the production and harvesting stage, the food losses are generally associated with weak infrastructure, in urban areas, the food losses are mainly due to poor consumer behaviors and eating habits. In both cases, the reduction in losses should be the priority to ensure adequate food is available for the malnourished communities.

Conclusion

Food system in Pakistan has its basis on depleting resource base and its sustainability is the key to achieve SDGs. The alarming situation highlights the need to not only utilize natural resources wisely and efficiently, but also conserve and enhance our local ecosystems through promoting sustainable land use practices. This can only be achieved through a holistic, multi-faceted food system strategy which could guide policies and practices through clearly defined short, medium, and long run milestones. The complex web of inter-connected activities in the agriculture sector and multilayered nature of the food system calls upon an action plan which could tackle issues at the institutional, political, regulatory, legal, and communal spheres simultaneously. Examining the whole value chain as one unit, appraising outcomes over processes, recognizing nutrition and food security as a fundamental human right and paying attention to a variety of local voices instead of individual perspectives are essential to design appropriate policies- which could ultimately help widening the opportunities for Pakistan to achieve sustainability in the food system.

















Annexure 1: Citizen Charter Of Demand For Food Security & Sustainable Livelihoods In Pakistan



Released on

Thursday May 27, 2021

We, the citizen of Pakistan represented by women, men, small land holder, farmers, fisher folks, live stocks & fruticulture entrepreneurs, NGOs, activists, policy level experts and Parliamentarians are pleased to be part of UN Food Systems Summit process through CSOs led virtual National Policy Dialogue on Food Security & Sustainable Livelihoods held at Islamabad on Thursday dated May 27, 2021, from 1030 hrs to 1400 hrs.: PST, 27 May 2021). The event organized by AwazCDS-Pakistan, Pakistan Development Alliance, VSO-Pakistan, and UKAid brought together rights holders and duty bearers at one platform for collective national efforts in the larger context of UN Food System Summit.

The stakeholders voiced numerous challenges related to food, agriculture, and livelihoods and share our demands and recommendations to federal and provincial government for sustainable food security and livelihoods for the people of Pakistan.

Farmers representation in the official forums and committees:

- Real and practicing smallholder women and men farmers should be included in the government committees at provincial and federal levels.
- Smallholder women and men farmers should be organized at farm and market level to safeguard their rights for better production, fair prices and sustainable livelihoods.

Right to Food and Nutrition:

- Food and nutrition security should be brought as enforceable fundamental right in the constitution of Pakistan.
- Nutrition is important for people and it should be incorporated in all the programs of agriculture and food security.
- Government should initiate training and support for kitchen gardening in rural and urban areas for improved nutrition.

Food Production and Farmers Income:

- Rising cost of production negatively impact smallholder farmers. Govt. should monitor erratic price of inputs for the benefit of farmers.
- Substandard quality of seeds and inputs negatively impact agricultural production and farmers livelihoods. Government departments should monitor quality issues of agricultural inputs.
- Government should ensure fair price of agricultural products to ensure sustainable livelihoods.
- Women and men smallholder farmers should receive concessionary loans and crop insurance in all provinces and regions
- Extension department should be revitalized to provide required technical support to smallholder farmers.
- Wage rates of women and men agriculture workers should be implemented according to the national or provincial minimum wage rates whichever is higher.
- Women and men farmers should be supported through trainings and financial resources to initiate value addition of their crop, vegetables, fruits, livestock and other agricultural products.

- Special emphasis required for newly merged districts of FATA in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to explore potential agriculture and food production.
- Micro finance support need to be initiated and ensured for all the processing phases of agricultural yield.

Women farmers and farm workers

- Agriculture system should prioritize women farmers from university curriculum to research up to extension system.
- Government should induct women staff to ensure timely and quality extension support for women farmers.
- Women should receive capacity building and financial support for crop, livestock, vegetable production as well as poultry and goat farming.
- Sindh Women Agriculture Workers Bill, 2019 should be implemented in letter and spirit. All
 other provinces should also ensure the replication of the similar legislations in their respective
 provinces and regions.

Livestock

- Special programs should be included in govt policies to address drought related situation in crop, livestock and all forms of agricultural production.
- Storage dams should be constructed to ensure food and agricultural production in drought hit and flood prone areas in all provinces.
- Livestock trainings and mobile livestock veterinary services should be provided in all the provinces.
- Women should also be given on farm training on livestock, goat/sheep and poultry farming

Climate Change

- Agriculture and related policies and programs should integrate climate change resilience from curriculum to research and up to extension system.
- Govt should conduct scoping studies to assess climate related risks and related measures in all provinces and regions.
- Government should strengthen efficient water utilization for agriculture in all provinces.
- Crop and food diversity is important for nutrition and climate resilience. This should be encouraged through variety of crop cultivation and naturally bred biofortified seeds.
- Pakistan has 11mhc cultivable waste. These marginal lands should be developed into new areas to produce agriculture and food crops.

Soon From LAHORE & KARACHI

A sister publication of CENTRELINE & DNA News Agency

www.islamabadpost.com.pk

ISLAMARAD EDITION

Price Rs. 20



Wakeup Pakistan: Getting too late for food security

Munir Ahmed



Shandana Gulzar. Convener of the Parliamentary Sub-Committee on Agriculture, feels determined to provide opportunities to young people and women to engage in food productions and processing systems and mechanisms in the country. She believes that food security policy 2018 shall be implemented in letter

AKISTAN is a graveyard of national policies. The recently buried one is the 'Food security' that was finalized and approved in 2018. Almost three years on, the stakeholders are waiting for any action on it. The participants of the recentfor any action on a. The participants of the recent ply organized conference by Awar CDS and Pakistan Development Alliance, VSO-Pakistan and UKAid on "Bood Security and Sustainable livelihood in Pakistan" have shown grave concerns on the policy dust-ing shelves. They demanded immediate kick off the implementation and letter and spirit.

implementation and letter and spirit.

The stakeholders voiced numerous challenges relat-ed to food, agriculture, and livelihoods and shared their recommendations for the federal and provincial their recommendations for the federal and provincial governments in smoher. They believe that on their charter of demand, the real and practicing smallhold-er women and men farmers should be included in the government committees at provincial and federal levels raise their voices to assfegant their rights for better production, fair prices and sustainable Irvia-hoody food and nutrition security should be brought hondy food and nutrition security should be brought as the production of the pro

of Passsan, and wase the nutrition is important or people, it should be incorporated in all the programs of agriculture and food security. No doubt, the government should initiate training and support for kitchen gardening in rural and urban areas for amproved nutrition. Indeed it's true that rising cost of production is negatively impacting small farmers. The provincial and federal governments shall monitor erratic price of inputs for the benefit of farmers. Substandard quality of seeds and inputs negatively impact sagricultural production and farmers invelitoods, the re-evant government departments shall monitor quality issues of agricultural inputs, and also ensure fair price of agricultural products to ensure sustainable liveli-hoods. The small farmers shall receive concessionary loans and corp insurance in all provinces and regions.

The conference emphasized the extension departments shall be revitalized to provide required technical support to small farmers; wages of agriculture workers shall be implemented according to the na-tional or provincial minimum wage rates whichever is higher; the farmer men and women shall be supported through trainings and financial resources to

livestock and other agricultural products.

The Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and federal governments shall have special emphasis on the newly merged districts of FATA in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to explore districts of PATA in Augher Failmannawa to expose potential agriculture and food production, and micro finance support shall also be extended to the natives of these areas. Women at the moment are not the focus in the agriculture system despite being in the heart actually, so women farmers shall be prioritized from university curriculum to research up to exten-sion system. Government shall induct women staff to ensure timely and quality extension support for wom-en farmers. Women should receive capacity building and financial support for crop, livestock, wegetable production as well as poultry and goat farming. Sundh Women Agriculture Workers Ball 2019 is still pending, it shall be implemented in letter and spirit. All other provinces shall also ensure the replication of

the similar legislations in their respective provinces and regions. Special programs should be included in government policies to address drought related situ government policies to address drought related sim-ations in crup, intestock and all forms of agricultural production. Scrage dams should be constructed to ensure food and gricultural production in drough hit and flood prone areas in all provinces. Livestock train-ing and mobile livestock veterinary services should be provided in all the provinces. Women abould also be given on farm training on livestock, goat and sheep and poultry farming to empower the marginalized women. Climate change is the worst threat to national water and food security. Agriculture and related policies and and nood security, agriculture and restret ponces are programs shall integrate climate change resilience from curriculum to research and up to extension systems. Government shall conduct scoping studies to assess climate related risks and related measures in all provinces and regions, and strengthen efficient in all provinces and regions, and strengthen efficient water utilization for agriculture in all provinces. Crop and food diversity is important for nutrition and cli-mate resilience. This should be encouraged through a variety of crop cultivation and naturally bred bio-fora variety of crip cunvasion and instantly wire dissis-tified seeds. Pakistan has Himbe cultivable waste. These marginal lands should be developed into new areas to produce agriculture and food crops. Shandana Gulzar, Convener of the Parliamentary

Sub-Committee on Agriculture, feels determined to provide opportunities to young people and women to engage in food productions and processing systems and mechanisms in the country. She believes that food security policy 2018 shall be implemented in letnot security pour, 2008 man be imperimented in set-ter and spirit while taking all the provinces and other related stakeholders on board equally. "We will en-courage provinces to develop their own food security policies in accordance with the national food security policy 2018. Before the 18th constitutional amendpears 2000, it was possible to have uniform policies for the whole country, however now provinces have their own agricultural policies too. They need to sync their agricultural policies with that of national food secertify policy if there is any challenge in this respect."

MNA Risz Fatyans Convener, National Parkamentary
Task Porce on SDGs shared that the government has intitated many social protection initiatives to ensure food
security of poor and marginalized communities under Sectiny of poor an independent communities under Ebiasis Program including Rashan Cards. The program will be licked off soon. He also shared that small land holders and farmers will be given Kissan cards to en-hance their productions. Government is also encouraging Agriculture Chambers and the first ever agriculture

ong agas unter chambers and in arrive sea graduates chamber will be initiated in Lahore soon. Zia ur Rehman, National Convener of Paisistan Devel-opment Alliance, believes that food security should be considered as a basic human right. Pakistan is also a signatory of many international treaties and conven-tions including UDHR, ICESCR, CRC, CEDAW, SDGs and Voluntary Guidelines to support the progres-sive realization of the right to adequate food for all citizens. These commitments demand that Pakistan should recognize food and nutrition security as fun-damental human rights; however this is pertinent to mention here that Pakistan's Constitution has yet to recognize the right to food for all. Wakeup Pakistan government before it's too late to secure food for 220 million people. Your slow response or no response would lead to a disaster we could never imagine.

The writes is a freelance journalist and broadcaster, Director Deveous Pakistan, a policy advocacy and outroach think tank in Islamabad. His email deven pakistan@gmail.com
Twitter Handle: @ElmnayeSyed



Understanding of the Issue	What do you know about sustainable food system and its contribution towards food security
Production Phase	 What crops do you produce? Do you keep livestock? How big is your land, do you own your land? What types of production methods do you use (Probe for crop rotations, organic, use of fertilizers and pesticides)? Do you think that farm workers whether family labour or hired labour adhere to occupational safety (probe to include protective clothing, disposal of chemical containers, availability of toilets/change rooms at farm)? Do you think there is that the level of food waste is at acceptable levels? How are products that have gone to waste handled? Are farmers in this area aware of climate change (e.g. conservation farming, water harvesting) What changes can you suggest that would improve the sustainability of the local food production system? How satisfied are you about our current cropproduction patterns compared with the previous patterns? Highlight, and elaborate the points about satisfaction and dissatisfaction. What are you anticipating about the future patterns, elaborate with arguments
	Is water being used sustainably, equitably and efficiently in irrigation / crop production? Are ground water levels manifered? Is there not not not in the control of
	 Are ground water levels monitored? Is there potential for expansion of irrigated areas?
	 Are other key inputs (such as fertilisers, pesticides etc.) readily and sustainably available and accessible? Are these inputs affordable? Are these meet the quality standards to contribute to improved production?
	 Is small land holding profitable and are they included in dynamic domestic and / or international supply chains?

	 What are the key issues regarding financial / capital access? How is it different for a small famer?
	 What is the nature and extent of land use? Is there expansion or contraction of the agricultural area? What are the key factors affecting these land use dynamics?
	 What is the situation regarding land degradation? How are crop yields compared with previous year's production?
	 What are the overall environmental impacts of our production patterns? GHG emissions, nutrient losses, pesticide emissions, soil and water quality degradation etc.?
	 Do you think there are biodiversity (monocropping and smaller pool of seeds – hybrid/high yielding varieties, impact of chemical fertilizers, over exploitation of ground water, etc.) losses due to food production patterns?
	 What is the trend? Is there any shift from food crop to other crops production or complete shift from agriculture/livestock to other income generating opportunities, what is the magnitude? What are the main reasons for the shift?
	 What are the good practices in food production patterns, are these sustainable or would be facing challenges in future? High the challenges if any?
	What are the key issues and challenges in food crops production faced currently, anticipated in near future. What would you suggest to overcome these challenges? What potential opportunities are available locally to meet challenges and bring positive impact
Processing Phase	 What is your involvement with the local food system? (Probe for selling food through it, buying food through it, providing financial or other organizational support.) What types of resources exist to help make locally produced food available to the community? (Probe for direct marketing outlets [such as farmers' markets,

	roadside stands, pick-your-owns] and contract sales to local food stores, restaurants, schools, colleges,
	hospitals, etc.)
	Do you think there is local government support for
	community efforts such as farmers' markets,
	community-supported agriculture, community
	gardens, etc.? this means political and economic
	support?
	• What is the role of the middle men in the food chain?
	How are food losses and waste handled throughout
	the value chain? What are the major barriers to
	making the community food system as successful as
	possible? • What changes can you suggest that would
	improve the local food system?
	How the market players in the supply chain, including
	formal and informal markets, traders, food companies,
	retailers etc. influence the pricing? Is there a
	monopoly of few dominant players? Elaborate how
	they influence the overall market?
	How much is the share of a formal and informal
	market in the food processing?
	Are there proper food storage mechanisms supported by Covernment or private contents available and
	by Government or private sector to avoid food wastage?
	wastage:
	 Do you think food loss and food waste occur due to
	lack of processing facilities? What is happening to food
	waste, food residues etc. what needs to be changed?
	Do you think transportation and road network play a
	key role in timely processing and supply? How would
	you rate these networks in your areas, in case of poor
	networks how it affects your income?
	What are the key issues and challenges in food
	processing faced currently, anticipated in near future?
	What would you suggest to overcome these
	challenges? What potential opportunities are available
	locally to meet challenges and bring positive impact
Consumption	Do you think our food is diversified, healthy and rich in
Phase	nutrients? Does it have any impact on the lifestyle and
	, ,

	diet related diseases?
	Are you satisfied with the current food and nutrition status in the country? What are the key underlying causes of malnourishment? Who are badly affected (children, women, men, boys, girls, pregnant and lactating women). What are you anticipating about the future?
	What is the nutritional and food security status of the people in the region/city?What are the different diets existing by social,
	economic and cultural groups? What are the drivers for food insecurity and malnutrition?
	 Can you access food produced in other areas (cities, districts, provinces etc) and where? How can the food security, availability, safety,
	appropriateness, utilization and transparency be enhanced of your area, province country etc.?
•	Do you think dietary preferences affect food system?
	Do you think there is a correlation between demand for health services for the treatment of non-communicable diseases resulting from food consumption habits and use of chemicals / pesticides?
	What are your thoughts on key trends and its impact on food system (urbanisation, migration, climate change etc.)?
	What are the key issues and challenges in food consumption faced currently, anticipated in near future? What would you suggest to overcome these challenges? What potential opportunities are available locally to meet challenges and bring positive impact

Food Security & Nutrition is a basic Human Right



Awaz Foundation Pakistan



Awaz Foundation Pakistan - Centre for Development Servies
Website: www.awazcds.org.pk, www.pda.net.pk
Email: info@awazcds.org.pk